

Nurturing the Struggle: Women's Politics of Patience in Demanding Environmental Justice in Cilacap

Merawat Perjuangan: Politik Kesabaran Perempuan dalam Menuntut Keadilan Lingkungan di Cilacap

Miftahul Huda✉

Faculty of Politics and Social Science, Diponegoro University, Indonesia

✉ emha@students.undip.ac.id

ABSTRACT: The PT S2P coal-fired power plant (CFPP) in Cilacap has generated considerable profits for the capitalist country since 2006, while simultaneously causing environmental damage and rendering local communities vulnerable. This paper employs a case study approach to examine the role of women's agency from the Global South in the social movement for environmental justice. It considers how global-local economic and political relations in Cilacap influence this movement. It sought to explain women's agency in claiming the right to a healthy and decent environment by testing the theory of the politics of patience, which located women outside and against state and corporate power. Through ethnography, in-depth interviews, and meetings with activists, public officials, and NGOs, this study depicted women as political actors in the face of the negative impacts of the state-electricity company nexus. In their struggles, women were confronted with gender stereotypes that were shaped by the state and reinforced by society. These stereotypes prevented women from participating in social movements that demanded their rights. The most important finding was that the nurturing role of women has ensured that the struggle for the right to a healthy and decent environment has lasted longer and has remained outside of and against the state.

ABSTRAK: Pembangkit Listrik Tenaga Uap (PLTU) PT S2P di Cilacap telah menghasilkan keuntungan yang cukup besar bagi negara kapitalis sejak tahun 2006, sementara pada saat yang sama menyebabkan kerusakan lingkungan dan membuat masyarakat setempat menjadi rentan. Tulisan ini menggunakan pendekatan studi kasus untuk mengkaji peran agensi perempuan dari negara-negara Selatan dalam gerakan sosial untuk menuntut keadilan lingkungan. Penelitian ini mempertimbangkan cara-cara di mana hubungan ekonomi dan politik global-lokal di Cilacap memengaruhi gerakan ini. Penelitian ini berusaha menjelaskan agensi perempuan dalam menuntut hak atas lingkungan yang sehat dan layak dengan menguji teori politik kesabaran, yang menempatkan perempuan di luar dan melawan kekuasaan negara dan korporasi. Melalui studi etnografi, wawancara mendalam, dan pertemuan dengan para aktivis, pejabat publik, dan LSM, penelitian ini menggambarkan perempuan sebagai aktor politik dalam menghadapi dampak negatif dari hubungan antara negara dan perusahaan listrik. Dalam perjuangan mereka, perempuan dihadapkan pada stereotipe gender yang dibentuk oleh negara dan diperkuat oleh masyarakat. Stereotipe ini menghalangi perempuan untuk berpartisipasi dalam gerakan sosial yang menuntut hak-hak mereka. Temuan yang paling penting adalah bahwa peran pengasuhan perempuan telah memastikan bahwa perjuangan untuk mendapatkan hak atas lingkungan yang sehat dan layak telah berlangsung lebih lama dan tetap berada di luar dan melawan negara.

Keywords:

environmental justice; gender in environmental issues; nurturing the struggle; politics of patience; women's rights

Kata Kunci:

keadilan lingkungan;
gender dalam isu-isu lingkungan;
merawat perjuangan;
politik kesabaran;
hak asasi perempuan

Diserahkan/Submitted:

23-01-2024

Diterima/Accepted:

23-08-2024

Cara Mengutip/How to cite:

Huda, Miftahul. "Nurturing the Struggle: Women's Politics of Patience in Demanding Environmental Justice in Cilacap". *Jurnal HAM*. Vol. 15 No. 2, August 2024, 129-142. DOI. 10.30641/ham.2024.15.129-142 <http://dx.doi.org/10.30641/ham.2024.15.129-142>

Copyrights/Hak Cipta (c) 2024

Miftahul Huda

1. Introduction

Women-nature connectedness¹ has encouraged women to move against destructive entities to preserve nature when nature is on the verge of destruction.² In the context of the movement for environmental justice (as a part of human rights), women are not only complementary in organizations/movements. Still, they produce and reproduce knowledge within organizations to endure the fight for environmental justice. For women from the Global South, the gender stereotype³ maintained by religious and cultural norms is one of the particular dimensions that entangle their steps to join the social movement. This unique condition occurred in Cilacap Regency, Indonesia, a locus of capital expansion in the form of a coal-fired power plant (CFPP) since 2006 that hindered women from linking with nature and joining the struggle against environmental destruction.

Nevertheless, women do not remain silent but engage in meaningful actions contributing to the struggle. Studies showed that women in the Global South have a way to engage in the movement despite being weakened through unequal gender relations with men.⁴ In the Indonesian context, specifically, Candraningrum,⁵ Udasmoro and Prügl,⁶ and Hendrastiti⁷ showed that women are not only under the gender hierarchy but also under the threat of capital expansion that requires land grabbing. They reveal that women join the action against destructive corporations using their instincts of care and gender connectedness to nature, even though hierarchical gender relations still exist. Joshi,⁸ Beck,⁹ and Hartviksen¹⁰ brought the experiences of women who carried out movements through domestic spaces to oppose authoritarian regimes' violence against women. Natalis, Purwanti, and Asmara¹¹ pointed out that modern environmental law and legislation were weapons of oppression for marginalized communities, especially women, and the environment, and also asserted that the environmental law product was shaped by political force. It means that the community must exert political pressure to achieve environmental justice. Linda T. Smith's decolonial paradigm echoed those topics, believing that "struggle" can be a blunt tool in mobilizing the masses.¹² It is blunt to see patriarchy and sexism in society, where equating men and women—in the context of the Global South—in the movements will lead to gender inequality and patriarchal bias.¹³ Considering

- 1 This term was coined by ecofeminists who claimed that there are conceptual, symbolic, and linguistic connections between feminist and ecological issues. It tends to argue that women are culturally tied to nature. With the idea that the oppression of nature is linked to the oppression of women, women ethically identify what is being lost in themselves as the environment is being destroyed. Sees Tong, Rosemarie, *Feminist Thought: A More Comprehensive Introduction third edition* (Westview Press, 2009), pg. 237-261.
- 2 See Miftahul Huda and Alfa Chusna, "Empowering Female Farmers Against Mining Capitalism," *Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender* 15, no. 1 (April 21, 2020): 127–46, <https://doi.org/10.21580/sa.v15i1.5311>; Terran Giacomini, "Ecofeminism and System Change: Women on the Frontlines of Struggle Against Fossil Capitalism and for the Solar Commons," *Canadian Woman Studies/Les Cahiers de La Femme*, 2016, <https://cws.journals.yorku.ca/index.php/cws/article/view/37530>; Vandana Shiva, *Staying Alive: Women, Ecology, and Survival in India* (United Kingdom: Zed Books, 1988).
- 3 See Sharyn Graham Davies, "Skins of Morality: Bio-Borders, Ephemeral Citizenship and Policing Women in Indonesia," *Asian Studies Review* 42, no. 1 (January 2, 2018): 69–88, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2017.1407292>; Dewi Candraningrum, *Negotiating Women's Veiling - Politics and Sexuality in Contemporary Indonesia* (Bangkok: Irasec, 2013); *Feminisme Islam: genealogi, tantangan, dan prospek di Indonesia* (Bandung: Mizan, 2021).
- 4 See Erin Beck, "The Long-Term Struggle for Violence against Women Legislation: The Guatemalan Women's Movement and the Politics of Patience," *Politics & Gender* 18, no. 4 (December 2022): 1043–76, <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X21000349>; Titiek Kartika Hendrastiti, "Oral Story of Women's Anti-Mining Group in Sumba: A Narrative of Subaltern Movement for Food Sovereignty," *Jurnal Perempuan* 24, no. 1 (March 7, 2019): 1, <https://doi.org/10.34309/jp.v24i1.291>; Julia Hartviksen, "A Matrix of Violences: The Political Economy of Violences against Mayan Women in Guatemala's Northern Transversal Strip," *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 24, no. 1 (January 1, 2022): 87–110, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2021.1976066>; Wening Udasmoro and Elisabeth Prügl, "No Matter What—I've Got Rights': Women's Land Grab Protests in Banyuwangi, East Java," *International Development Policy | Revue Internationale de Politique de Développement*, no. 13 (June 22, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.4000/poldev.4655>; Dewi Candraningrum, "The Spiritual Politics of the Kendeng Mountains Versus the Global Cement Industry 1," in *After the Death of Nature* (Routledge, 2018), 219-234, <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315099378-14/spiritual-politics-kendeng-mountains-versus-global-cement-industry-1-dewi-candraningrum>.
- 5 Candraningrum, "The Spiritual Politics of the Kendeng Mountains Versus the Global Cement Industry 1."
- 6 Udasmoro and Prügl, "No Matter What—I've Got Rights'."
- 7 Hendrastiti, "Oral Story of Women's Anti-Mining Group in Sumba."
- 8 Saba Joshi, "Gendered Repertoires of Contention: Women's Resistance, Authoritarian State Formation, and Land Grabbing in Cambodia," *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 24, no. 2 (March 15, 2022): 198–220, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2022.2053295>.
- 9 Beck, "The Long-Term Struggle for Violence against Women Legislation."
- 10 Hartviksen, "A Matrix of Violences."
- 11 Aga Natalis, Ani Purwanti, and Teddy Asmara, "Anthropocentrism vs Ecofeminism: How Should Modern Environmental Law Be Reformed?" *Sortuz: Oñati Journal of Emergent Socio-Legal Studies* 13, no. 1 (2023): 88–68.
- 12 *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*, 3rd ed. (London: Zed Books, 2021).
- 13 Jacqueline Urla and Justin Helepololei, "The Ethnography of Resistance Then and Now: On Thickness and Activist Engagement in

previous studies, this study wants to fill the gap in social movement theory by examining the Global South women's resilience within the social movement to claim their women's rights when they face gender inequality and are under state and company power. In this investigation, the author sheds light on a key question: how do women practice the politics of patience to survive long-term in the struggle with men in the context of demanding environmental justice, unequal gender relations, and challenging the nexus of state-corporation power?

Women's rights are an important part of this debate. This right is linked to the quality of the environment as a link between women's roles and nature. The commonly used approach to understanding human rights is often far removed from women's bodily autonomy, which makes women's agency invisible when they fight for their rights. Their autonomy leads them to demand that the state fulfill and protect their rights, *i.e.* women's relationship with nature, culture, and subsistence economy.¹⁴ However, due to the economic and political relations between the state and corporations, which hindered the fulfillment of rights, women eventually optimized social movements to claim their rights. Conversely, research on natural resource or ecological conflicts in Indonesia indicates that social movements advocating for environmental justice are consistently positioned in opposition to state actors who have consolidated their power with corporations.¹⁵ This illuminates that the political strategy of women's resilience in fighting for environmental justice differs from Beck's findings, and it needs to be tested whether it is possible for resistance against the state within the framework of politics of patience to occur in demands for environmental justice.

In this article, the long-term involvement of women in social movements demanding environmental justice was explained by Appandurai's politics of patience theory. Politics of patience requires a pragmatic approach within the complexity of political vision based on the idea of transformation with the key question of how women's groups can escape from vulnerable circumstances by undergoing a long-term process.¹⁶ That theory, however, was inadequate to explain the act of women's long-term struggle as well as the circumstances surrounding them and their opposition to the state. This problem was completed by Joshi's gendered repertoire theory, which contributed to eradicating the androgyny embedded in Tilly's contentious politics theory. According to Joshi, women's performance in the social movement cannot be separated from the way the state and society construct "women" (repertoires) so that the women's act takes place in their daily lives (performative acts). This article highlights that the act of the performative is nurturing, which is a concept that contains strategies for resisting the state and corporations. Those acts of nurturing are pillars for supporting the politics of patience, where undergoing a long-term struggle is not enough just to live it, but also to take care of it (nurturing the struggle).

This ethnographic research involved an extended period of observation and interviewing local women, activists, and local officers in Cilacap. The findings revealed that women played a multifaceted role in the movement, nurtured the long-term struggle, and advocated for environmental justice for a long time. They also demonstrated a unique ability to bridge the public and domestic spheres. The character of victories in demanding environmental justice was incremental, and women could keep the corridors of social movements outside and against state power during the struggle. Moreover, women were able to successfully negotiate their gender roles with the broader community. They then proceeded to build up their political power and knowledge capacity, which enabled them to engage in planning and decision-making within the social movement. This article portrayed these findings through five discussions, *i.e.*, investigating environmental degradation, weaving the CSO-NGO relationship, regenerating actors, taking over religious institutions, and planning adaptation strategies for living in a damaged environment.

This study took the context of Cilacap women who face the adverse effects of Coal-Fired Power Plant (CFPP, *Pembangkit Listrik Tenaga Uap/PLTU*) activities on the environment. This environmental impact lasts long, requiring extra patience in fighting for environmental justice. The ability to recognize and acknowledge environmental impacts is a process that can take considerable time. In the case of the CFPP, which commenced operations in 2006, it took approximately three years after commenced for this awareness to emerge. Additionally, it was observed that women required a longer time to reach this level of awareness than men. Unequal gender roles influence the disparity of knowledge about environmental impacts between men and women. In this research

the Twenty-First Century," *History and Anthropology* 25, no. 4 (August 8, 2014): 437, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02757206.2014.930456>.

14 Rhoda E. Howard-Hassmann, "Universal Women's Rights Since 1970: The Centrality of Autonomy and Agency," *Journal of Human Rights* 10, no. 4 (2011): 433–49, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14754835.2011.619398>.

15 Hendrastiti, "Oral Story of Women's Anti-Mining Group in Sumba."

16 Arjun Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," in *Cities of the Global South Reader*, ed. Faranak Miraftab and Neema Kudva (Taylor and Francis, 2001), 30, <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315758640-41/deep-democracy-urban-governmentality-horizon-politics-arjun-appadurai>.

locus, namely in Winong Hamlet, women only realized and recognized the adverse effects of the environment in 2017.

2. Method

The qualitative research was conducted using grounded theory research.¹⁷ This research framework used feminist ethnography¹⁸ which positioned the author as a participant observer and part of LBH Yogyakarta (as a human rights defender), which has been involved in Winong community advocacy since 2021. The implementation of this research spanned from July 2021 to July 2023 in Winong Hamlet, Slarang Village, Kesugihan District, Cilacap Regency. In a span of two years, the researcher went directly to the field 13 times with a duration of 3-5 days. To highlight the contribution of women in the movement, the research process conducted in-depth unstructured interviews with 6 local women activists across generations, 15 *Forum Masyarakat Winong Peduli Lingkungan* (Winong Community for Environmental Forum, FMWPL) activists, 6 activists of FMWPL's network, 5 hamlet-level officials, and 7 people from three non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The author used a pseudonym for the names of the interviewees in this article to protect their privacy. To enhance the rigor of the analysis, the author gathered data from the official local government, the official health department, data from the Community Health Center (*Puskesmas*) Kesugihan District, and environmental documents (Amdal¹⁹ and Addendum) of the CFPP of PT S2P. In addition, the author conducted several direct meetings with local government officials, such as the Cilacap Regency Government, the Environmental Office of Cilacap Regency (DLH), the National Board of Disaster Management (BNPB) of Cilacap Regency, and the Slarang Village Government, to advocate for specific issues. The official data was useful in addressing the environmental political landscape in Cilacap and its relationship with local communities. For a complete critical analysis, the author reviewed data from 3 NGOs involved in environmental advocacy for the Winong community, namely the Yogyakarta Legal Aid Institute (LBH), Friends of the Earth of Central Java (Walhi Jateng), and the Indonesian Centre for Environmental Law (ICEL). These data can be found in press releases, reports, research results, and scientific publications related to environmental advocacy in Cilacap. In addition, the author triangulated interview data, government reports, and NGO reports.

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1 Electrification: Environmental Degradation Driven by State-Corporation Nexus

The global-local economic alliance, according to Appadurai, was driven by the adoption of the Marshall Plan, namely technology transfer (capital accumulation) and electoral democracy. As a result, half of the world's population lives in severe poverty. The significant cause was the meaninglessness of public participation in an electoral democratic system accompanied by market-oriented policies.²⁰ In this section, the author focused on how the accumulation of capital by the state-corporate nexus has worsened the livelihood of Cilacap citizens, namely environmental degradation and human rights abuse.

International institutions, such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank, played a role in conditioning the state order and its supporting policies to ensure the expedited capital from capitalist countries.²¹ When the conditioning period was over, then the capitalist corporation entered to expand their capital to fund the construction of the CFPP PT S2P. The World Bank, IMF, and Asia Development Bank (ADB), together with the Government of Indonesia, made structural adjustments in the electricity sector in 1998-1999 through a Letter of Intent/Memorandum of Economic and Financial Policy (MEFP) on March 16, 1999.

The electric capitalist project continued and strengthened by creating policies that subserve the market and "secure" investors.²² President Soeharto (the second President of Indonesia) using neoliberal policies through

17 Grounded theory is an approach that can derive theories from an analysis of the patterns, themes, and common categories discovered in observational data. In this research, the author employed grounded theory to examine the theory of politics of patience and juxtaposed it to how women practiced it in the context of the struggle for environmental justice. See Earl Babbie, *The Practice of Social Research*, 13th edition (Canada: Wadsworth, CARNAGE Learning, 2013), 336–37.

18 Dána-Ain Davis and Christa Craven, *Feminist Ethnography: Thinking through Methodologies, Challenges, and Possibilities* (London: Rowman & Littlefield, 2016).

19 *Analisis Mengenai Dampak Lingkungan*, environmental permit.

20 Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," 24.

21 Samir Amin, *Capitalism in the Age of Globalization: The Management of the Contemporary Society*, 2nd ed. (London: Zed Books, 2014), 14–17.

22 Utsa Patnaik and Prabhat Patnaik, *Capital and Imperialism: Theory, History, and the Present* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 2021), 94, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv11vc9px>.

Presidential Decree No. 37 of 1992 regarding Electricity Supply Business by Private Sector amplified conditioning by international institutions, which allowed the private sector to participate in the provision of national electricity. In May 2003, financing capital worth USD 501 million for the construction of Cilacap CFPP units 1 and 2 2x300 MW was entered through the signing of an Engineering, Procurement, Construction (EPC) Contract between PT S2P and Chengda Engineering Corporation of China (CECC). The Governor of Central Java carried out local-level executions by issuing an Environmental Permit on December 15th, 2004, and CFPP officially operating in 2006.

Furthermore, the expansion of unit 3, generating a capacity of 1x660 MW, received an Investment Principle License (*Izin Prinsip Penanaman Modal*) from the Regent of Cilacap in 2012. In 2013, the expansion received a loan from China Development Bank worth USD 700 million. Indonesian relations with Chinese capitalists continued to strengthen until in 2016, PT S2P and PT Pembangkit Jawa Bali (PJB) signed a syndicated loan worth USD 1,398 billion with the Bank of China, China Development Bank (CDB), and Bank Rakyat Indonesia (BRI) for the expansion of unit 3A project by 1x1000 MW.²³ The 1x660 and 1x1000 MW expansions, which were completed in 2019, were part of the 35 GW project.²⁴ This project was first outlined in the ambitious program of the Indonesian Administration, called the Master Plan for the Acceleration and Expansion of Indonesian Economic Development (MP3EI), which was initiated in 2011 under President Soesilo Bambang Yudhoyono. Subsequently, President Jokowi initiated the National Strategic Project (PSN) in 2014, which employed the same developmental paradigm as the previous initiative. In the meantime, the land requirement of 120 ha for the Cilacap CFPP was based on the composition of land owned by the Indonesian Army (67 ha), with 20 ha belonging to the Cilacap Regional Government, and the remaining 33 ha comprising land acquired from residents through a land acquisition scheme.²⁵

While local communities grappled with a multitude of environmental damage, the state's approach to fulfilling a healthy and decent environment deteriorated, resulting in a flagrant violation of human rights. Through Government Regulation (*Peraturan Pemerintah*) No. 22/2021 on Implementation of Environmental Protection and Management, fly ash and bottom ash (FABA) have been excluded from the category of hazardous and toxic waste (*limbah bahan beracun dan berbahaya*, B3). The policy has threatened the community adjacent to the power plant, especially if the corporation cannot properly manage the ash yard. The government answered the health crisis experienced by the community by turning the crisis into a business:²⁶ considering economic value as a policy-making guide. There was a public (and government) perception of the CFPP's inability to manage the large volume of FABA production and the threat to the population's health around the CFPP. At the same time, the businessman found enormous economic potential in its management. This economic value, as seen in the study by the People's Representative Council of the Republic of Indonesia,²⁷ is considered first with the justification of scientific-based knowledge in removing FABA from the category. This business practice involved the utilization of FABA for a variety of purposes, including the production of cement raw materials,²⁸ the support of agricultural infrastructure,²⁹ the stockpiling of materials for mine reclamation, and the creation of planting media for revegetation.³⁰

- 23 LBH Yogyakarta, "Executive Summary: Akhiri PLTU Batubara Cilacap Dan Tinjau Ulang Kawasan Peruntukan Industri Karangandri," Executive Summary (Yogyakarta: LBH Yogyakarta, August 31, 2022), 2–3, <https://lbhyogyakarta.org/2022/08/31/executive-summary-akhiri-pltu-batubara-cilacap-dan-tinjau-ulang-kawasan-peruntukan-industri-karangandri/>.
- 24 See ESDM, "Proyek 35.000 MW: Groundbreaking PLTU Cilacap 1.000 MW," government media, ESDM, Oktober 2016, <https://www.esdm.go.id/id/media-center/arsip-berita/proyek-35000-mw-groundbreaking-pltu-cilacap-1000-mw>; D&C Engineering, "Ground Breaking PLTU Cilacap 1x1000MW - D & C Engineering," [dcengineeringindonesia.com](https://dcengineeringindonesia.com/en/achievements-detail/ground-breaking-pltu-cilacap-1x1000mw/35), Oktober 2016, <https://dcengineeringindonesia.com/en/achievements-detail/ground-breaking-pltu-cilacap-1x1000mw/35>.
- 25 Dian Yanuardy et al., "Ekonomi Politik Energi dan Industri Kelistrikan: Studi Kasus PLTU Cilacap dan Cirebon," Working Paper (Bogor: Sajogyo Institute, 2022), 42, <https://sajogyo-institute.org/ekonomi-politik-energi-dan-industri-kelistrikan/>.
- 26 Takeshi Ito, Noer Fauzi Rachman, and Laksmi A. Savitri, "Power to Make Land Dispossession Acceptable: A Policy Discourse Analysis of the Merauke Integrated Food and Energy Estate (MIFEE), Papua, Indonesia," *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 41, no. 1 (January 2, 2014): 29–50, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03066150.2013.873029>.
- 27 Teddy Prasetyawan, "Kontroversi Penghapusan FABA dari Daftar Limbah B3," *INFO Singkat: Kajian Singkat terhadap Isu Aktual dan Strategis* XIII, no. 7 (April 2021): 13–18.
- 28 Semen Tonasa Indonesia, "Komitmen Semen Tonasa Gunakan FABA sebagai Bahan Baku Alternatif Semen," *Semen Tonasa* (blog), August 3, 2021, <https://www.sementonasa.co.id/commitmen-semen-tonasa-gunakan-faba-sebagai-bahan-baku-alternatif-semen/>.
- 29 Rifky Syofiadi, "PLN Terus Dorong Pemanfaatan FABA PLTU, Bahan Baku Industri Murah dan Mampu Reduksi Emisi Hingga 44%," *PT PLN (Persero)* (blog), June 17, 2023, <https://web.pln.co.id/cms/media/siaran-pers/2023/06/pln-terus-dorong-pemanfaatan-faba-pltu-bahan-baku-industri-murah-dan-mampu-reduksi-emisi-hingga-44/>.
- 30 "Fly Ash dan Bottom Ash (FABA) Hasil Pembakaran Batubara Wajib Dikelola" (Jakarta: Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan, March 15, 2021), <https://ppid.menlhk.go.id/berita/siaran-pers/5864/fly-ash-dan-bottom-ash-faba-hasil-pembakaran-batubara-wajib-dikelola>.

Initially, the government was declining concern about environmental justice. The central and local governments demonstrated a lack of competence in fulfilling the human rights related to a decent and healthy environment as guaranteed through Article 5 paragraph (1) of the Environmental Protection and Management Law (32/2009). Secondly, the right to the environment is violated by the state, as enshrined in Article 28H(1) and Article 33 of the 1945 Constitution. The constitution's provisions are designed to ensure that every citizen can enjoy a healthy environment in which to live. The state therefore must ensure that this is the case. By removing FABA from the B3 waste category, the state has endangered the lives of the Winong people and prevented them from enjoying their right to a healthy environment.³¹ This regulation, as suggested by Sinaga, Santoso, and Prananingtyas,³² endangers the environment and residents in the vicinity of the CFPP, even though the CFPP has a business license to manage FABA. The current storage and utilization protocols for FABA are insufficiently rigorous for business actors. This potentially leads to soil contamination and the circumvention of accountability for environmental degradation, which is contrary to the polluter pays principle.³³

The Regional People's Representative Council and the local government played a role in the preparation of the Spatial and Regional Plan, which deliberately violated the technical guidelines for industrial estates in the Minister of Industry Regulation No. 35/2010 regarding Technical Guidelines for Industrial Areas, which requires a minimum distance between industrial sites and settlements to be 2 kilometers. Then, the passing of the Job Creation Law through the Omnibus law method in 2020 nullified public participation. In addition to harming democracy, some of its Articles have made it difficult—even hindering—local communities from maintaining their environment. The regulatory circumstance has threatened human rights, particularly the right to a healthy and decent environment.

3.2 Weaving the CSO-NGO Relationship

The state-corporate nexus that occurred in Cilacap makes it impossible for grassroots movements, as Appadurai noted, to form alliances with state actors as a means of demanding environmental justice.³⁴ Due to the poor state of democracy and the state's business relationship with corporations, it is only possible to form alliances consisting of non-state actors, namely CSO-NGOs. In this context, women played a key role in bringing CSOs and NGOs together and then collecting the data needed for advocacy. Beck described this step as the bargaining power of citizens as experts and direct participants in policy-making vis-à-vis the state and corporations.³⁵

Table 1. FMWPL's Protests and Demands to CFPP Based on Events to Adapt to a Damaged Environment

No.	Events/Impact	FMWPL's Strategy	Output	Years
1.	FABA pollution	Protesting to the Ministry of Environment and Forestry in Jakarta and submitting demands to the CFPP	Installation of nets to cover the ash yard and coal yard	2018-2019
		Protesting to DLH Cilacap and submitting demands to the CFPP	Establishment of a <i>Koperasi Udang</i> (Shrimp Cooperative)	2019
2.	Complaints from a group of mothers for Empowering Family Welfare (PKK) while adjacent to the CFPP	Submission of claims to CFPP	Received relief funds of Rp 15 million, administered through the <i>Koperasi Simpan Pinjam</i> (Savings and Loan Cooperative of) Wijaya Kusuma.	2018

31 Sri Wartini, "Phase-out PLTU Batubara dan Pemulihan Ekosistem Pesisir Berbasis Perubahan Iklim: Pengalaman Empiris dari Masyarakat Cilacap" (Focus Group Discussion, Yogyakarta, Oktober 2023), 16.

32 Pidari Sinaga, Budi Santoso, and Paramita Prananingtyas, "The Effect of FABA Removal from B3 Waste List on Indonesia's Commitment at Cop-26 in Climate Actions," in *Proceedings of the 1st International Workshop on Law, Economics and Governance* (Proceedings of the 1st International Workshop on Law, Economics and Governance, IWLEG 2022, 27 July 2022, Semarang, Indonesia, Semarang: EAI, 2023), 5–6, <http://dx.doi.org/10.4108/eai.27-7-2022.2326293>.

33 Della Syahni, "Was-Was Abu Batubara Kala Tak Lagi Masuk Limbah Berbahaya," Mongabay.co.id, May 11, 2021, <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2021/05/11/was-was-abu-batubara-kala-tak-lagi-masuk-limbah-berbahaya/>.

34 Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," 25–26.

35 Beck, "The Long-Term Struggle for Violence against Women Legislation," 8.

No.	Events/Impact	FMWPL's Strategy	Output	Years
3.	Well water dried up due to dewatering activity	Protesting and making claims to the CFPP	Installation of PDAM and received a subsidy of Rp. 100 thousand per month for 2 years Received a subsidy for the purchase of gallons of water and health care of Rp 300 to Rp 600 thousand per house.	2018-2020 2019
4.	Noise pollution from power generation	Protesting, public hearing, and submitting demands to the CFPP	Each time an operational test is carried out, the CFPP issues a notification letter to the residents.	2019-2022
5.	Abrasion is caused by the dredging of sea sand by the CFPP to reduce sedimentation and increase by natural factors and sand mining.	Protesting, submitting demands to the CFPP and DLH Cilacap	Breakwater construction	2016-2023

Source: processed by the author based on field findings.

Laksmi, a middle-aged mother of three, claimed to be an opponent of Walhi's arrival in 2017. She believed that the CFPP improved the welfare of the community; and on the contrary, Walhi's arrival would only create discord in the community by bringing the issue that the CFPP harmed the community and the environment.³⁶ Based on this situation, Laksmi founded a civil society organization dedicated to fighting for the environment. In 2017, FMWPL was formed by Winong residents and accompanied by Walhi. In addition, Laksmi became a focal point that helped build confidence and spread awareness that environmental conditions in their village were being threatened by the CFPP. However, due the gender stereotypes, it was not easy for Laksmi to become a core activist. She was frequently discriminated against simply for being a woman, particularly when she was involved in social movement activities. It became a "cut and dried" thing among people who practiced Javanese and Muslim culture, which considers women to be permitted to venture into public spaces provided that their domestic duties have been completed.³⁷ The experiences entangled Laksmi in fighting for the environment, participating in strategizing struggles, and making decisions within the organization. Even so, she contributed to weaving the CSO-NGO relationship despite the ongoing discrimination.

Appadurai said that the CSO-NGO partnership is a strategic and long-term relationship in which there is a strategy to win rights. To fill the gap left by Appadurai, the author put forth the concept of repertoires of anti-politics,³⁸ which encouraged the alliance to refrain from engaging in electoral politics (or with state actors). Laksmi's repertoire was informed by her previous organization, Community Aspiration Committee (KAM) in 2009, which engaged in practical money politics and ultimately undermined the value of the struggle. The alliance was able to learn from the experiences of Laksmi and ex-KAM. As a consequence of her experience there, Laksmi was subsequently involved in the organization, education, and mobilisation of citizens in collaboration with the aforementioned alliance, to reject electoral politics.³⁹ As a result, in 2018 the community of Winong, under the name of the FMWPL, went to Jakarta together with Walhi Jateng to report hazardous and toxic waste pollution generated by CFPP PT S2P to the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK).⁴⁰ In 2019, community groups from Winong hamlet and Slarang Village organized a protest at the Environmental Service Office (DLH) of Cilacap Regency, demanding that the government address the issue of FABA waste pollution affecting the community.⁴¹ This illustrates the patience and perseverance of the mothers, who waited a considerable period

36 Interviewed with Laksmi, October 18th 2021.

37 *State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in New Order Indonesia* (Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2011).

38 Joshi, "Gendered Repertoires of Contention," 210.

39 Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," 29.

40 See Pascal S. Bin Saju, "Terancam Limbah Beracun, Warga Cilacap Demo ke KLHK," Berita, kompas.id, September 13, 2018, <https://www.kompas.id/baca/sekilas/2018/09/13/terancam-limbah-beracun-warga-cilacap-demo-ke-klhk/>; Indra Nugraha, "Keluhan Polusi PLTU, Warga Cilacap Lapor Ke Kementerian Lingkungan," Mongabay.co.id, September 18, 2018, <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2018/09/18/keluhan-polusi-pltu-warga-cilacap-lapor-ke-kementerian-lingkungan/>; Tommy Apriando, "Derita Warga Cilacap Hidup Bersama Pembangkit Batubara," Berita, Mongabay.co.id, September 6, 2018, <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2018/09/06/derita-warga-cilacap-hidup-bersama-pembangkit-batubara/>.

41 Eviyanti, "Cemari Lingkungan PLTU Karangandri Cilacap Didemo Warga," Berita, Pikiran Rakyat, Oktober 2019, <https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/nasional/pr-01320206/cemari-lingkungan-pltu-karangandri-cilacap-didemo-warga>; Wilibrordus Megandika Wicaksono, "Warga Protes Debu Batubara PLTU di Cilacap," Berita, kompas.id, September 30, 2019, <https://www.kompas.id/baca/>

for a decision from the local government to protect their children from the potential health risks associated with CFPP's pollution.

In 2019, FMWPL and Walhi Jateng allied with Legal Aid Institute (LBH) Yogyakarta, an NGO focused on legal, human rights, and democracy, to seek legal opportunities and organize the citizens. Subsequently, in 2019, Laksmi and Salma, a young FMWPL woman and a female student, were employed by LBH Yogyakarta as paralegals. This allowed them to pursue their role as human rights defenders, particularly in providing legal aid. This process entailed enhancing the knowledge base related to human rights and weaving interdisciplinary NGOs encompassing the environmental and legal domains. Moreover, in 2020, the Indonesian Center for Environmental Law (ICEL) joined the alliance, focusing on environmental law studies. The initiative undertaken by women in the alliance to enhance their organizational management, environmental expertise, and strategic planning for advancing their demands has yielded notable outcomes. More broadly, they have optimized the alliance's knowledge base to leverage public awareness. Despite acknowledging that achieving environmental justice remains a formidable challenge and an ongoing process, they recognize the necessity to prepare for potential confrontations with the state-corporate nexus. This movement, as Smith suggested,⁴² was developed by the grassroots community and women nurtured FMWPL straight on their goals while the alliance acted as a facilitator.

3.3 Giving birth to actors: efforts to regenerate the struggle

Appadurai suggested that "patience as a long-term political strategy is especially hard to maintain life and space that frequently assails"⁴³ the marginalized community. The objective of knowledge transfer is to extend the scope of struggle through an alliance strategy that targets the recruitment of younger generation cadres. This intergenerational struggle is an integral aspect of the politics of patience. One of the key challenges in long-term struggles is the risk of moral fatigue and a loss of motivation to continue the fight. In the case of FMWPL, this vulnerability can be addressed by the alliance through the strategies to mobilize the younger generation, or by encouraging parents to invite their children to join the organization.

If FMWPL fails to regenerate its activist ranks—due, for instance, to an aging of the existing activists or a lack of younger people joining the movement—then the CSO-NGO alliance will prove inadequate. Laksmi has initiated and provided an example of how to cultivate movement leaders to strengthen FMWPL's position, namely by promoting her daughter, Marta. Marta has been active since the beginning of the FMWPL movement and has been at the forefront of protests, hearings, and networking with cross-organizations. Significantly, she can transform knowledge and reproduce awareness among her young friends to join FMWPL or at least get involved in demanding environmental justice even though they were not part of the forum.

The youth movement is widespread, not centralized in the FMWPL body. The movement extends to religious-based institutions, such as the Darul Falah Al-Qur'an Education Park (TPQ),⁴⁴ the Mosque Youth Association (*Ikatan Remaja Masjid*, Irmas),⁴⁵ and the *Nahdlatul Ulama* Women's Student Association (IPPNU).⁴⁶ Three women activists occupy important positions in these three domains. Marta is head of the Winong branch of IPPNU, Karlina (with Marta) is a teacher at TPQ, and Rani is head of Irmas. TPQ has a strategic position in the reproduction of knowledge on environmental justice because it is where children aged 6-13 years in Winong Hamlet receive religious education. In the meantime, Irmas's existence, under Rani's leadership and with Marta and Karlina's participation, becomes a space where the three can deepen their knowledge of environmental justice. In a broader sense, Irmas is a tool that can be a multiplier of environmental awareness to all age groups in the hamlet of Winong. In addition, youth capacity was also strengthened through the *Sekolah Energi* (Energy School)⁴⁷ initiated by Winong Youth and LBH Yogyakarta in April 2022 and *Pesantren Ekologi* (the Ecological

utama/2019/09/30/warga-protes-debu-batubara-pltu-di-cilacap.

42 *Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples*, 124–26.

43 Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," 30.

44 *Taman Pendidikan Quran* (TPQ) is an informal religious education institution that generally takes place in the afternoon after students have completed their formal education in the morning.

45 *Ikatan Remaja Masjid* or Irmas is a religious organization located in a Mosque, which is managed by the youth. The function of this organization is to spread the message of Islam among the youth at the village level or higher in accordance with the status of the mosque.

46 *Ikatan Pelajar Perempuan Nahdlatul Ulama* (IPPNU) is an Islamic community organization that is a subdivision of the Pengurus Besar Nahdlatul Ulama (PBNU), which is involved in spreading Islamic messages among female students. The organization has a hierarchy from the hamlet level up to the national level.

47 *Sekolah Energi* or The Energy School was initiated to raise awareness among the youth of Winong about fossil fuels, especially coal, which is at the heart of their environmental degradation and PLTU's presence in their village.

Boarding School)⁴⁸ organized by Walhi Central Java in March 2023. This program has increased the youth's knowledge and awareness of the threat CFPP's use of dirty energy (coal) poses to the global climate and its direct impact on the environment.

3.4 Taking over religious institutions

The objective was to cultivate a sense of critical consciousness regarding the right to a healthy and decent environment. This was achieved through the transformation of knowledge, which was carried out by women and disseminated to children through religious institutions. Activities in both social movement and religious ceremonial spaces ultimately led to the successful takeover of religious institutions by women and youth to support the political agenda of social movements. This section argues that Islam as an institution is being contested to support the agenda of social movements on the one hand, and the maintenance of social piety based on environmental concerns on the other. This process is being carried out by women and is associated with the politics of patience.

Four women run TPQ, and Karlina is one of the permanent teachers there. It took them a long time to take over the institution. Women wait for the right moment while they develop their capacity for religious knowledge and devote themselves to teaching religious knowledge to children. There, the women care for the children's religious morals through Islamic pedagogy using *Kitab Kuning* and teaching materials such as *Safinah al-Najah (fiqh)*, *Tajwid*, and worship practices. In the teaching process, the reality of the daily life next to the CFPP is always linked to the subject matter of the teaching materials.⁴⁹ For example, Marta's TPQ pedagogy illustrates how she used the institution to spread environmental ethics. On several occasions, she took her students to the area of the abrasion to demonstrate the destructive power of the CFPP on the environment. She also used the drawing method to evoke memories of the environment in her students. In addition to the TPQ, the takeover of the mosque also bridged the agenda of Walhi Jateng's *Pesantren Ekologi* in the month of Ramadan 2023, which had failed several times when the mosque was still under the control of a religious figure in opposition to the FMWPL.

Before being run by women, the TPQ was led by the forum's opponent, Ustadz Subki, who was also head of the mosque's administration (*takmir*). On one occasion, Subki discussed many things, among them his position between the community and the CFPP. The following excerpt from the interview captures the essence of his political stance:

"You could say I'm duplicitous, but I don't take sides. I can attach it to the CFPP to use it to build the mosque, but I don't want it to be controlled [by the CFPP]. I can also work with the community to preach, and I definitely resist the environmental impact caused by the CFPP. But there shouldn't be any kind of resistance to the CFPP, for example, a demonstration, even if something can be of use.." – Subki, April 2022.

Since Subki holds an important position in religious institutions, he deeply influences the morals of the community. The religious institutions are Baitul Muttaqin Mosque and TPQ of Darul Falah. His position in the mosque is Head of Takmir, while in TPQ, he is Head and TPQ Owner. Additionally, Subki is a teacher of *Kitab Kuning* and a traditional preacher for the mothers' group in Winong.

Marta, Rani, and Karlina had been the subject of political pressure from Subki due to their status as activists against the CFPP. According to Marta, Subki had once warned the students of the TPQ and the administration of Irmas not to engage in any protest. According to Subki, protests like Marta's are pointless. Subki then argued that the CSR money from the CFPP could be used to support preaching facilities, such as the construction of a mosque and education activities at TPQ. The existence of mosque infrastructure with the logo of the CFPP of PT S2P here and there justifies Subki's view. On the other hand, Marta's view is that the TPQ and the mosques are places where a wider audience can be reached to raise awareness of the environmental damage caused by the CFPP's activities. This means that, as long as they do not deviate from Islamic values, the two religious institutions have become strategic arenas for social movements because they can reach a wider community and are authoritative.

FMWPL members are thus faced with a dilemma when it comes to deciding how to position themselves religiously in the social movement. On the one hand, they need a religious figure, but on the other hand, the religious figure does not support the political stance of the forum. The religious figure and his or her support

48 *Pesantren Ekologi* or Ecological boarding school is an activity to promote awareness of human connection with the environment. This activity takes place in the month of fasting, and the term *pesantren* is often used as a slogan in every activity in the month of fasting, for example, *Pesantren Kilat*. The choice of this name is highly considered to appeal to the youth.

49 See Saba Mahmood, *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2005), 79–80.

for the political stance of the FMWPL have to be integrated. This condition leads the Forum to a chosen figure who they believe can promote morality and does not oppose the political stance of the FMWPL, namely Ustadz Ahmad. Laksmi and the Forum were also determined to have Ahmad as a Takmir leader so that his role would be more strategic, as is often discussed in the Forum, namely to give ecological sermons (*pengajian ekologi*). Meanwhile, Ahmad's good relations with the youth and the FMWPL's political views made him a favorite figure for Marta, Karlina, and Rani.

At last, the political dream for Ahmad came true without FMWPL's political plan. At the end of 2022, Subki was involved in a scandal. He had an affair with a married woman who was also his student in Winong. Karlina was one of the women who seriously criticized Subki's behavior. She took several improvised steps to get Subki to leave Winong. As a result, Subki was subject to social sanctions and was no longer in a position of authority in two religious institutions. Ahmad was automatically 'promoted' to Takmir leader. Unfortunately, forum members experienced "political perplexity" in using Ahmad's position because it was not based on a political plan. Even before Subki happened, however, women had come to dominate the religious institutions. The morality of children and the importance of combining religious morality with environmental concerns are at the heart of their concern for TPQ.

3.5 Adaptation strategy in a damaged environment

Merchant noted that women around the world have made a connection to nature. Subsequently, she classified socialist ecofeminism emphasizing the maintenance of an ecological-productive-reproductive equilibrium between humans and nature as a fundamental tenet of this theoretical framework.⁵⁰ Despite the ineptitude of the government and the challenges posed by a deteriorating environment, women demonstrate resilience and determination in their pursuit of gender equality. They persist in developing strategies with the alliance to advocate for the fulfillment of women's rights, underscoring their commitment to achieving these crucial societal changes, like collecting environmental pollution data that challenges the findings of government agencies and private corporations. As illustrated by Appadurai, this strategy was previously employed in Mumbai City and yielded incremental victories.⁵¹

The subsistence economic resources of the Winong community have been eroded by the loss of agricultural land and the several enclosures of fishing areas to serve the CFPP. As the CFPP's operation expands and government policies ignore environmental sustainability, the situation worsens. It is undeniable that the members of the FMWPL live with concerns about food availability and threats to their health from environmental degradation. In such conditions, economic survival is more important than continuing to fight, which risks making their lives worse. However, if circumstances allow, they do not hesitate to fight.⁵² This adaptation strategy had to be formulated because the members of the FMWPL, especially the women, decided to remain in their native land even though the environmental conditions were not suitable for living. Moreover, the response which was given by the Cilacap Regency Government at the hearing held in May 2023⁵³ did not provide any solution to the citizens' vulnerability matrix: economic, environmental, and health. The Government's response was to give two options to the residents: being relocated (a euphemism for eviction) with compensation, or staying there with the consequences of being exposed to pollution and the threat of assets being lost due to abrasion.

In this context, the role of women is at the heart of the food system and ensuring the health of families. Unfortunately, women's spatial space is a contradiction, where they have to play domestic roles but face the destruction of food systems⁵⁴ and livelihoods due to an electricity investment project that threatens intergenerational justice. Responding to the harmful activities of the CFPP by making demands to adapt to an ever-changing environment is the pattern of political movement used by the alliance. For example, in 2018, clean water, a basic necessity, dried up because of the dewatering activities of the CFPP. The FMWPL responded by mobilizing residents to protest and demanded that the CFPP conduct an environmental audit to investigate the causes of the lost well water.⁵⁵ The CFPP was found guilty of drying up the residents' wells, but another environmental audit

50 Carolyn Merchant, *Radical Ecology: The Search for a Livable World*, 2nd ed. (New York & London: Routledge, 2005), 211.

51 Appadurai, "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics," 26–27.

52 James C. Scott, *The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia* (London: Yale University Press, 1977), 5–8.

53 Walhi Jawa Tengah, "Masyarakat Dusun Winong Meminta Kejelasan Terkait Kawasan Peruntukan Industri Karangandri," *Walhi Jateng* (blog), May 26, 2023, <https://www.walhijateng.org/2023/05/26/masyarakat-dusun-winong-meminta-kejelasan-terkait-kawasan-peruntukan-industri-karangandri/>.

54 Janet M. Conway, "When Food Becomes a Feminist Issue: Popular Feminism and Subaltern Agency in the World March of Women," *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 20, no. 2 (April 3, 2018): 11, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2017.1419822>.

55 The results of groundwater research in 2019 stated that the CFPP's dewatering activities had caused residents' well water to dry up.

was conducted in 2020, which found that the well water had reappeared. The women's experience is that the water is no better than it was before the dewatering, although research shows that the groundwater has reappeared and meets quality standards.

"Well water can be salty or brackish, and can have a variety of odors." – Nuri, 2022.

"Instead, I decided to remove the PDAM⁵⁶ and re-use the water from the well. The problem is that the cost of PDAM is expensive. It is registered in the name of industrial needs, not residents. Besides, PDAM water stinks of chlorine, well water is better." – Murni, 2023.

The loss of groundwater is a maldevelopment program that contravenes the logic of the water cycle. Vandana Shiva posits that this development model is predicated on a reductionist, arrogant, and anti-women perspective. The installation of PDAM was regarded as a panacea for the water crisis and an efficacious means of improving the water cycle. Shiva maintains that while water can be distributed and wasted, the availability of water on Earth is united and limited by the water cycle.⁵⁷ The scarcity of water has had a detrimental impact on the roles and needs of women.

The community's adaptation patterns to survive in a degraded environment are illustrated by the strategies in Table 1. At a time when economic resources were declining, women, through the Empowering Family Welfare (*Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga*, PKK), set up and managed the *Koperasi Simpan Pinjam Wijaya Kusuma*⁵⁸ in 2016. The cooperative received CSR from the CFPP in 2018. Although the study notes that CSR was part of a divisive act, in this case, women were able to manage and develop the economy. The cooperative has provided loans to many women and men, enabling many residents to establish businesses after losing their rice fields and coastline. Such economic self-sufficiency is one of the goals of the struggle, and women play a major role in it. Laksmi became the head of the cooperative and ran a *Tempe* business with four other women to gain economic independence and help the family economy.

The satisfaction of one demand does not mean the cessation of other protests when the CFPP is involved in harmful activities. "Political sanity" continues to be maintained, turning risks into opportunities to make demands to improve lives. For example, Laksmi and Marta participated in FMWPL protests against noise caused by CFPP operational errors seven times between the end of 2019 and May 2022. Unfortunately, during one of the protests, the CFPP did not agree to the FMWPL's demand for a thousand chickens. The last time the 1 x 660 MW generator broke down, the noise lasted 31 hours. A group of mothers feared that their children, who study in a school less than 50 meters from the CFPP, would be disturbed by the noise.

"I was annoyed, I wanted to invite children still at school to join the noise complaint. But someone said that we shouldn't invite children to strike because we could be arrested for child protection." – Lakshmi, 2022.

Protests and demands, in the minds of the women, are a way of putting pressure on the CFPP to stop destroying the environment recklessly, and a way of showing that the political power of the FMWPL still exists. The protests have demonstrated the power of citizens to set a threshold for "tolerable damage" and damage that must be repaired, at a time when the Regency government, as the supervisor, is permissive towards the CFPP, as if there is no life cycle in Winong that needs to be protected.

4. Conclusion

In many ways, including the extent of gender relations, global-local political-economic relations have significantly suppressed the quality of women's lives and violated their human rights. In this article, the representation of the position of women is not limited to the field of social movements. Without abandoning their position in social movements, as highlighted above, this study has found that woman's agency has been formed along with the influx of capital for the expansion of the CFPP that caused environmental damage and, in opposition, their involvement in building political power through the alliance of CSOs and NGOs. Based on those

From these results, the CFPP was required to install PDAM and provide a PDAM water "subsidy" worth Rp. 100 thousand per month and provide gallons of water to every affected resident. This subsidy stops after 2 years after the well waters were declared available and met quality standards.

56 *Perusahaan Air Minum Daerah*, Regional Drinking Water Company.

57 Shiva, *Staying Alive: Women, Ecology, and Survival in India*, 174.

58 Savings and loan cooperative of Wijaya Kusuma adalah lembaga bukan bank dengan kegiatan usaha menerima simpanan atau menabung dan memberikan pinjaman kepada anggotanya. Kegiatan usaha lainnya adalah membuat tempe dan menerima pesanan katering.

findings, women's position is not weakened, as was the aim of the New Order (functional role). Instead, they are able to adapt to spatial conditions to express their gender, claim their rights, and further strengthen their political position. As actors, women contribute to improving the quality of life of families and communities amid life's uncertainties. The complexity of women's problems in Cilacap has encouraged the author to use a gender lens as a core analysis. The main contribution of this study is that women's politics of patience is manifested in the role of nurturing and 'acting outside and against the state': nurturing organizational resistance to demand the state to fulfill and protect women's human rights, broadly environmental justice. Meanwhile, actions to nurture resistance take the form of (a) weaving the CSO-NGO relationship, (b) giving birth to movement actors (regeneration), (c) taking over religious institutions, and (d) developing adaptation strategies. These roles in four different areas have registered women's agencies in the social movement for environmental justice. They have played a role in feeding the flame of resistance to the CFPP.

This study is constrained by its focus on the ongoing process of grassroots women's activism. While the alliance has achieved incremental victories, the changes in gender relations within the alliance have not been subjected to rigorous analysis. Further studies are required to examine the flow of women's strategies within the alliance and their influence on the erosion of gender stereotypes in the fight for environmental justice, as outlined in the politics of patience framework.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author conducts this research to contribute to advancing sciences, particularly the political science field. Full appreciation is given to the informants and Legal Aid Institute of Yogyakarta for their support throughout the research period. This research is also part of fulfilling the doctoral study requirements.

REFERENCES

- Amin, Samir. *Capitalism in the Age of Globalization: The Management of the Contemporary Society*. 2nd ed. London: Zed Books, 2014.
- Appadurai, Arjun. "Deep Democracy: Urban Governmentality and the Horizon of Politics." In *Cities of the Global South Reader*, edited by Faranak Miraftab and Neema Kudva. Taylor and Francis, 2001. <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315758640-41/deep-democracy-urban-governmentality-horizon-politics-arjun-appadurai>.
- Apriando, Tommy. "Derita Warga Cilacap Hidup Bersama Pembangkit Batubara." Berita. Mongabay.co.id, September 6, 2018. <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2018/09/06/derita-warga-cilacap-hidup-bersama-pembangkit-batubara/>.
- Bangstad, Sindre. "Book Review: Saba Mahmood, Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject. Princeton, NJ and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2005. 264 Pp. ISBN 978—0—691—08695—8, \$23.95 (Pbk)." *Feminist Theory* 11, no. 2 (August 1, 2010): 216–18. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14647001100110020802>.
- Beck, Erin. "The Long-Term Struggle for Violence against Women Legislation: The Guatemalan Women's Movement and the Politics of Patience." *Politics & Gender* 18, no. 4 (December 2022): 1043–76. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X21000349>.
- Butler, Judith P. *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex."* New York & London: Routledge, 1993.
- Candraningrum, Dewi. *Negotiating Women's Veiling - Politics and Sexuality in Contemporary Indonesia*. Bangkok: Irasec, 2013.
- . "The Spiritual Politics of the Kendeng Mountains Versus the Global Cement Industry 1." In *After the Death of Nature*, 219–34. Routledge, 2018. <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9781315099378-14/spiritual-politics-kendeng-mountains-versus-global-cement-industry-1-dewi-candraningrum>.
- Conway, Janet M. "When Food Becomes a Feminist Issue: Popular Feminism and Subaltern Agency in the World March of Women." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 20, no. 2 (April 3, 2018): 188–203. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2017.1419822>.
- Davies, Sharyn Graham. "Skins of Morality: Bio-Borders, Ephemeral Citizenship and Policing Women in Indonesia." *Asian Studies Review* 42, no. 1 (January 2, 2018): 69–88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2017.1407292>.
- Davis, Dána-Ain, and Christa Craven. *Feminist Ethnography: Thinking through Methodologies, Challenges, and Possibilities*. London: Rowman & Littlefield, 2016.

- D&C Engineering. "Ground Breaking PLTU Cilacap 1x1000MW - D & C Engineering." [dcengineeringindonesia.com](https://dcengineeringindonesia.com/en/achievements-detail/ground-breaking-pltu-cilacap-1x1000mw/35), Oktober 2016. <https://dcengineeringindonesia.com/en/achievements-detail/ground-breaking-pltu-cilacap-1x1000mw/35>.
- Decolonizing Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples. 3rd ed. London: Zed Books, 2021.
- ESDM. "Proyek 35.000 MW: Groundbreaking PLTU Cilacap 1.000 MW." Government media. ESDM, Oktober 2016. <https://www.esdm.go.id/id/media-center/arsip-berita/proyek-35000-mw-groundbreaking-pltu-cilacap-1000-mw>.
- Eviyanti. "Cemari Lingkungan PLTU Karangandri Cilacap Didemo Warga." Berita. Pikiran Rakyat, Oktober 2019. <https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/nasional/pr-01320206/cemari-lingkungan-pltu-karangandri-cilacap-didemo-warga>.
- Feminisme Islam: genealogi, tantangan, dan prospek di Indonesia. Bandung: Mizan, 2021.
- Fox-Hodess, Katy. "The 'Iron Law of Oligarchy' and North-South Relations in Global Union Organisations: A Case Study of the International Dockworkers Council's Expansion in the Global South." *Labor History* 63, no. 4 (July 4, 2022): 459–78. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0023656X.2022.2066073>.
- Giacomini, Terran. "Ecofeminism and System Change: Women on the Frontlines of Struggle Against Fossil Capitalism and for the Solar Commons." *Canadian Woman Studies/Les Cahiers de La Femme*, 2016. <https://cws.journals.yorku.ca/index.php/cws/article/view/37530>.
- Gill, Jagger. *Judith Butler: Sexual Politics, Social Change and the Power of Performative*. New York: Routledge, 2008.
- Goldman, Michael. "Dispossession by Financialization: The End(s) of Rurality in the Making of a Speculative Land Market." *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 47, no. 6 (September 18, 2020): 1251–77. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03066150.2020.1802720>.
- Hartviksen, Julia. "A Matrix of Violences: The Political Economy of Violences against Mayan Women in Guatemala's Northern Transversal Strip." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 24, no. 1 (January 1, 2022): 87–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2021.1976066>.
- Hendrastiti, Titiek Kartika. "Oral Story of Women's Anti-Mining Group in Sumba: A Narrative of Subaltern Movement for Food Sovereignty." *Jurnal Perempuan* 24, no. 1 (March 7, 2019): 1. <https://doi.org/10.34309/jp.v24i1.291>.
- Huda, Miftahul, and Alfa Chusna. "Empowering Female Farmers Against Mining Capitalism." *Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender* 15, no. 1 (April 21, 2020): 127–46. <https://doi.org/10.21580/sa.v15i1.5311>.
- Ito, Takeshi, Noer Fauzi Rachman, and Laksmi A. Savitri. "Power to Make Land Dispossession Acceptable: A Policy Discourse Analysis of the Merauke Integrated Food and Energy Estate (MIFEE), Papua, Indonesia." *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 41, no. 1 (January 2, 2014): 29–50. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03066150.2013.873029>.
- Joshi, Saba. "Gendered Repertoires of Contention: Women's Resistance, Authoritarian State Formation, and Land Grabbing in Cambodia." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 24, no. 2 (March 15, 2022): 198–220. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616742.2022.2053295>.
- Kan, Karita. "The Social Politics of Dispossession: Informal Institutions and Land Expropriation in China." *Urban Studies* 57, no. 16 (December 1, 2020): 3331–46. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098019897880>.
- LBH Yogyakarta. "Executive Summary: Akhiri PLTU Batubara Cilacap Dan Tinjau Ulang Kawasan Peruntukan Industri Karangandri!" Executive Summary. Yogyakarta: LBH Yogyakarta, August 31, 2022. <https://lbhyogyakarta.org/2022/08/31/executive-summary-akhiri-pltu-batubara-cilacap-dan-tinjau-ulang-kawasan-peruntukan-industri-karangandri/>.
- Lund, Christian. *Nine-Tenths of the Law: Enduring Dispossession in Indonesia*. Yale University Press, 2020.
- Mahmood, Saba. *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2005.
- Murdie, Amanda, and Dursun Peksen. "Women and Contentious Politics: A Global Event-Data Approach to Understanding Women's Protest." *Political Research Quarterly* 68, no. 1 (2015): 180–92.
- Novianto, Arif, Kurnia Cahyaningrum Effendi, and Yuyun Purbokusumo. "The Politics of Virtue for Capital Accumulation." *PCD Journal* 9, no. 1 (2021): 101–20. <https://doi.org/10.22146/pcd.v9i1.3760>.
- Nugraha, Indra. "Keluhkan Polusi PLTU, Warga Cilacap Lapor Ke Kementerian Lingkungan." [Mongabay.co.id](https://www.mongabay.co.id/2018/09/18/keluhkan-polusi-pltu-warga-cilacap-lapor-ke-kementerian-lingkungan/), September 18, 2018. <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2018/09/18/keluhkan-polusi-pltu-warga-cilacap-lapor-ke-kementerian-lingkungan/>.
- Patnaik, Utsa, and Prabhat Patnaik. *Capital and Imperialism: Theory, History, and the Present*. New York: Monthly Review Press, 2021. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctv11vc9px>.

- Saju, Pascal S. Bin. "Terancam Limbah Beracun, Warga Cilacap Demo ke KLHK." Berita. kompas.id, September 13, 2018. <https://www.kompas.id/baca/sekilas/2018/09/13/terancam-limbah-beracun-warga-cilacap-demo-ke-klhk>.
- Scott, James C. *The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia*. London: Yale University Press, 1977.
- Shiva, Vandana. *Staying Alive : Women, Ecology, and Survival in India*. United Kingdom: Zed Books, 1988.
- State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in New Order Indonesia*. Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2011.
- Susilowati, Linda, and Petsy Jessy Ismoyo. "Women's Role in Central Java Agriculture: A Case Study on Qaryah Tayyibah Peasants Association." *Jurnal Perempuan* 24, no. 1 (March 7, 2019): 67–76. <https://doi.org/10.34309/jp.v24i1.300>.
- Tilly, Charles. "Contentious Politics and Social Change." *African Studies* 56, no. 1 (1997): 51–65. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00020189708707860>.
- Tong, Rosemarie. "Towards a Feminist Global Ethics." *Global Bioethics* 33, no. 1 (December 31, 2022): 14–31. <https://doi.org/10.1080/11287462.2021.2011002>.
- Tripathi, Siddharth. "International Relations and the 'Global South': From Epistemic Hierarchies to Dialogic Encounters." *Third World Quarterly* 42, no. 9 (September 2, 2021): 2039–54. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2021.1924666>.
- Udasmoro, Wening, and Elisabeth Prügl. "'No Matter What—I've Got Rights': Women's Land Grab Protests in Banyuwangi, East Java." *International Development Policy | Revue Internationale de Politique de Développement*, no. 13 (June 22, 2021). <https://doi.org/10.4000/poldev.4655>.
- Urla, Jacqueline, and Justin Helepololei. "The Ethnography of Resistance Then and Now: On Thickness and Activist Engagement in the Twenty-First Century." *History and Anthropology* 25, no. 4 (August 8, 2014): 431–51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02757206.2014.930456>.
- Walhi Jawa Tengah. "Masyarakat Dusun Winong Meminta Kejelasan Terkait Kawasan Peruntukan Industri Karangandri." *Walhi Jateng* (blog), May 26, 2023. <https://www.walhijateng.org/2023/05/26/masyarakat-dusun-winong-meminta-kejelasan-terkait-kawasan-peruntukan-industri-karangandri/>.
- Wang, Austin Horng-En. "Patience, Dynamic of Protest, and Democratic Consolidation." *European Political Science* 18, no. 3 (September 1, 2019): 473–90. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41304-018-0177-4>.
- Wicaksono, Wilibrordus Megandika. "Warga Protes Debu Batubara PLTU di Cilacap." Berita. kompas.id, September 30, 2019. <https://www.kompas.id/baca/utama/2019/09/30/warga-protes-debu-batubara-pltu-di-cilacap>.
- Yanuardy, Dian, Sheila Herlita, Neni Nurrahmawati, Siti Latifa, Fikrian Firdaus, Muklis, Izzudin Prawiranegara, Fathurrahman, Novi Kurniati, and Fandi Ramadhan. "Ekonomi Politik Energi dan Industri Kelistrikan: Studi Kasus PLTU Cilacap dan Cirebon." Working Paper. Bogor: Sajogyo Institute, 2022. <https://sajogyo-institute.org/ekonomi-politik-energi-dan-industri-kelistrikan/>.

Author Statements:

Conflict of Interest - The author certifies that he has no affiliation with or involvement in any organization or entity with any financial interest, or non-financial interest in the subject matter or materials discussed in this manuscript. The author reports the following details of any affiliation or involvement in an organization or entity with a financial or non-financial interest in the subject matter or materials discussed in this manuscript.

Statement of Originality – The author certifies that the intellectual content of this article is the author's own work and that all assistance received in its preparation and its sources are duly acknowledged. Furthermore, the author certifies that the content of this article has not been previously published or is currently being submitted to any journal, to the best of the author's knowledge.